

Final Monitoring Report (Replication activities from November 2011 to May 2012)

Country:	Thailand
Pilot City:	Chiang Rai Municipality, Chiang Rai Province
Thematic Area:	Institutional Governance
Project:	Cooperation for Integrated Solid Waste Management Project
Number and Title of Activity (refer to application):	Activity 17 Monitoring and consultations during the implementation of transfer concepts
Reported by:	1) Mrs. Rungnapa Tubnonghee 2) Ms. Nuttiga Hempattarasuwan
Date reported:	28 June 2012

How do you evaluate the overall progress, starting from the beginning of the action until end of May 2012? Provide a picture comparing the pre-situation with the situation in May 2012.

1. Methodology of the monitoring and progression

(1)Description of monitoring approach: The monitoring was followed by log frame with the 3 results.

(1.1) Result 1: The first result is the network of integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality. This result has 2 activities to implement.

Activity 1.1

-Meeting to set committees and teams for a network of integrated solid waste management comprised of local organizations around Chiang Rai Municipality.

-Meeting to clarify the guidelines for cooperation for integrated solid waste management as well as brainstorming of ideas for the establishment and appointment of a network of local organizations conducting integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality on Tuesday, 29 November 2011.

Activity 1.2



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).

-Meeting of the joint task force for updating and follow-up (quarterly) on Wednesday, 28 December 2011

(1.2) Result 2: The Local organizations that join in the network of integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality has a increasing capacity to manage the solid waste especially at the source in community and local. This result has 2 activities to implement.

Activity 2.1

-To train by the workshop and study tour on good solid waste management in Thailand at Pichit municipality in Phichit province and Pitsanulok municipality in Pitsanulok province on 22-23 February 2012.

Activity 2.2

-Meeting of the join task force for updating and follow-up (quarterly) the second quarter.
-To present the progress report of the activities and programs of cooperation in the framework for the relationship (Log frame).
-Meeting for Production of solid waste management achievement manual for local government in Chiang Rai on Friday, 25 May 2012.
-To consult to produce the document of production of solid waste management achievement manual for local government in Chiang Rai.

(1.3) Result 3: The project or the activity about the solid waste management at source was set as the best practice for the community and the other local organization in Chiang Rai province. This result has 1 activity to implement.

Activity 3.1

-To set the sharing and knowledge seminar/meeting about the solid waste management at source on World Environment Day on June 2, 2555.

2. To collect the related documents with log frame. Agency of Chiang Rai municipality will collect the related document for the 3 results and the activity in each the result.

3. To interview and share to observe the depth interviews in two times. The first one was done in the meeting of the activity 1.1. Mr. Prasung Towtakul who is



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).



the assistant of Chiang Rai municipality mayor was interviewed. The second depth interview was done in the meeting of the activity 1.2. Mr.Somsak Nuntachai who is director of public health and environmental, Ban Du municipality was interviewed.

4. To analyze data from the depth interviews and observations.
5. To summarize and report the monitor and progression of all of the activity in each the results.
6. To collect the photo and compare since before run the project and after finish the project from November 2011-June 2012.

What have been the main achievements of project replication? Refer to the objectives and results.

1. Get format of the network accompanies between the local organization 19 organizations in the administration manages at the source for the solid waste that is the first priority problem of Chiang Rai city.
2. The local organization in Chiang Rai have administration trend manages the solid waste that can induce to manage effectively in the area.

What have been the main benefits for the people so far (e.g. socio-economic/and or environmental impact of replication)? And how did this impact the living condition of the people? Please refer to the overall objective.

- 1) The solid waste quantity was decreased in the area and helps to decrease expenses responsibility in the saving carry and disposal cost of the local organization.
- 2) People in community sorts out the solid waste at a house before abandons. The recycle waste can be induced to sell and build the income to their family.
- 3) In the part of the community that does the activity in garbage bank, can build participating in within the community , decrease the expenses, build good conscious in garbage lead comes back to apply new , and modifying or invent the solid waste to souvenir goods, help encourage building occupation and build the income to housekeeper group and the community.
- 4) The sharing experience was occur and learns each other between the community, the private sector, the government organization sector and



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).



the foreign countries. The knowledge will to induce to apply and do referable and develop effectively in the community of oneself.

- 5) The good awareness and the conscious will realized in with regard to develop the locality of oneself, by the addition builds the latency of oneself, institute and community for vigorously and last long.
- 6) The best cooperation was formatted each other between the local organization, the government and the involved organization in the solid waste administration of Chiang Rai city.

What impacts (e.g. in terms of capacity) could you observe on behalf of the pilot city taking part in this project on transnational best practice exchange?

- 1) The local organizations get the good awareness and the realized conscious. They feel with enthusiasm and the attentiveness in the solid waste management. Moreover, they see the importance of the administration manages the solid waste especially to separate at source.
- 2) The best cooperation was formatted each other between the local organizations with the community in term of the recycle waste separation.
- 3) Since, Chiang Rai Municipality launches this project. The personnel, involved organizations and communities were built capacity in the solid waste administrations. They were gotten the vigorous and last long in the area of oneself. In addition to, Chiang Rai municipal has still to be a model and can extend results the best practice of the solid waste management to the network.

Did the city cooperate with third bodies (e.g. LGAs, business, or academia) which supported the replication process?

- 1) The municipality league in province level get come in participate and have important role in participating of people in the solid waste administration. That municipality league can create the complete cooperate of the locality and support the budget. In Chiang Rai province, by the mayor of Wiang Taeng municipality gets appointed to league municipality Chiang Rai chairman know a problem of the solid waste administration and will ask for cooperation everywhere municipality in Chiang Rai. He set to promote and encourage having activity for the solid waste administration increase to people.
- 2) The Big C department store (private sector) cooperates with Chiang Rai municipality to separate the recycle waste and reduce the garbage at source. The separated activity was done by the attention policy. The box or waste of packaging was return to the production company every time



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).

to helping decrease the solid waste quantity. Besides, natural resources and environmental office of Chiang Rai, the Pollution Control Department has testified to support academic knowledge.

- 3) Mae Fah Luang University (academia) attends to are working with network cooperation group between the government of Chiang Rai province, and still attend all activity at pertaining to the solid waste administration continuously.

Has the knowledge been shared with other cities, or even been replicated to other cities?

- 1) The sharing experience was launched to train and study tour at Phichit and Phitsanulok municipality for the local organization that sign MoU in this project. The knowledge of the solid waste management will induce to apply and do referable and develop effectively in the community of oneself. This activity takes action on 22-24 February 2012.
- 2) The sharing experience was learned between the network around Chiang Rai municipality , such as Mae Kow Tum ad Pa Or Don Chai municipality get come to study observe activities The recycle bank in the area and invite an expert from Chiang Rai municipality go to present the knowledge and train the project resuscitate volunteer public health permanent village.
- 3) The sharing experience was learned between the network of local organization and the educational institution. Mae Yow municipality has invited an expert from Hahnd Sowng Keaw Municipality, Uttaradit Province (That has confiscated area manner and the environment that are similar). The technocrat from Mae Fha Luang University go to present the knowledge about the solid waste administration to community agent and volunteer public health permanent village.

Which follow-up actions do you recommend?

- 1) People in the community and an officer of local organization lack the skill, knowledge, not enough pertaining to manage the solid waste. Every local organization should emphasize capability expansion to the community and the personnel about the solid waste administration at source, and enhance something the public relations in building understanding and the importance of the solid waste administration at the source.
- 2) The building participating of the community and sharing experience learn the solid waste of good administration from community and local organization that succeed together with very the activity / the project that relate and follow up.



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).

- 3) The build mechanical participating between local organization with people (Co-management) in the solid waste completely administration (It should cover from the beginning the way until the destination).
- 4) The increase efficiency in the driving moves of local organization that give come in take care the environment follows the duty of the self clearly, such as the driving moves the procedure manages completely the solid waste, the administration are correct traditionally the public health in burying covers up the solid waste.
- 5) The solid waste administration regards one part of infrastructure development, the supporting has the legislation for supports with 3Rs (Reduce, Reuse, Recycle) pillars for reinforces side environment policy of the country vigorously. The cooperation in proceeding policy 3Rs with other administration of the solid waste.

How will the city continue replicating the best practice? What are the planned activities until end of 2012?

- 1) The arrangement of the working group works for a report and follow the progress of proceeding project that have develop or create to originate new project of the network after get share the activity and the project of DELGOSEA.
- 2) The operating expansion and public project relations give locality adjacent institute where no attend the project since the initial and have the share more and more.



This project is co-funded by the European Union.



A Project implemented by the consortium: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V., Thailand Environment Institute (TEI), Local Government Development Foundation Inc. (LOGODEF), United Cities and Local Governments for Asia and Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC), Association of Indonesian Regency Governments (APKASI), Association of Cities of Vietnam (ACVN), and National League of Communes/Sangkats of the Kingdom of Cambodia (NLC/S).

Name of Pilot City, Country: Chiang Rai City, Chiang Rai Province			
Name of Reporter: Mrs. Rungnapa Tubnonghee, Ms. Nuttiga Hempattarasuwan			
Thematic Area: Institutional Governance			
Project Title: Cooperation for Integrated Solid Waste Management Project			
Monitoring Period: December 2011 – May 2012			
Specific Objective (as stated in the project design)	Indicators (as stated in the project design)	Sources of Information	Possible Risks (external and internal)
To provide understanding and develop the guide-lines of cooperation for integrated solid waste management between local organizations around Chiang Rai Municipality on the occasion of the 750th anniversary of the establishment of Chiang Rai.	At least 5 out of 23 local organizations around Chiang Rai Municipality can develop and implement integrated solid waste management projects, especially at the upstream level.	- Meeting report - Progress monitoring report	<p>1) Operational risks includes the failure of equipment and visual aids during the meeting, and insufficient and inaccessible media and public relation programs.</p> <p>2) Personnel risks include personnel's lack of skill, knowledge and expertise in upstream solid waste management. Shortage of manpower in each local organization is also a risk.</p> <p>3) Risk from external events that are out of the project managers' control. An example is policymakers and senior executives being unable to attend meetings due to urgent work commitments elsewhere. Importance should be placed on policymakers and senior executives in the creation of cooperation in upstream and downstream solid waste management, and in the creation of networks.</p> <p>4) Budgetary risks; Since solid waste management requires machinery, vehicles and supplies, it requires a budget for repairs or maintenance if assets are damaged during collection, transportation and disposal of waste solid waste landfill.</p>
Results (as stated in the project design)	Indicators (as stated in the project design)	Sources of Information	
Result I: Setting a network of integrated solid waste	At least 5 local organizations around Chiang Rai	- Progress monitoring report -Chiang Rai	

<p>management comprised of local organizations around Chiang Rai Municipality.</p>	<p>Municipality joined with the project to cooperate in integrated solid waste management. These organizations include: -Mae Yoa Municipality, -Ban Du Municipality, -Huay Sak Tambon Administrative Organization, -Tha Sai Tambon Administrative Organization, -Rob Wiang Tambon Administrative Organization.</p>		<p>Province's authorization to establish committees and teams that are part of the network of local organizations conducting integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality -Collected signatures from organizations seeking to be members of the network of integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality</p>			
<p>Please list all activities which lead to result I:</p>	<p>Planned in month</p>	<p>Executed in month</p>	<p>Sources of Information</p>	<p>Steps achieved - until last period</p>	<p>Steps achieved –in current period</p>	<p>Problem faced and follow up action</p>
<p>Activity 1.1 -Meeting to clarify cooperation under the network of upstream and downstream integrated solid waste management (The senior executive include 1 person the coordinator include 1 person and community representatives include 2 people) -Meeting to clarify the guidelines for cooperation in integrated solid waste</p>	<p>29 November, 2011</p>	<p>29 November, 2011</p>	<p>- Meeting report - Progress monitoring report - Chiang Rai Province's authorization to establish committees and teams that are part of the network of local organizations conducting integrated solid</p>	<p>- To arrange the 1st meeting with the Steering Committee of Chiang Rai Municipality and coaches to finalize the draft agenda and prepare for the 2nd meeting, review what have already done with the activity</p>	<p>- Chiang Rai Municipality organized the meeting based mainly on the logical framework approach. - Finalize the draft for Chiang Rai Province command of the committee and teamwork of a network of integrated solid waste management local organizations around</p>	

<p>management as well as the brainstorming of ideas for the establishment of committees and teams for the network of integrated solid waste management comprised of local organizations around Chiang Rai Municipality. (100 participants/1day)</p>			<p>waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Collected signatures from organizations seeking to be members of the network of integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality 	<p>1.1 of cooperation in integrated solid waste management.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The 2nd meeting with the Steering Committee the working team of Chiang Rai Municipality and others local organizations focusing on establishing committees and teams for a network of local organizations conducting integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality. 	<p>Chiang Rai Municipality.</p>	
<p>Please list all activities which lead to result I:</p>	<p>Planned in month</p>	<p>Executed in month</p>	<p>Sources of Information</p>	<p>Steps achieved - until last period</p>	<p>Steps achieved –in current period</p>	<p>Problem faced and follow up action</p>
<p>Activity 1.2 Meeting the network’s team to share, learn, and monitor the results of operations (Trimester)</p>	<p>28 December, 2011</p>	<p>28 December, 2011</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Meeting report - Progress monitoring report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To set up the network working group meeting of the join task for updating and follow-up activities and work plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Chiang Rai Province’s authorization to establish committees and teams that are part of the network of local organizations conducting integrated solid waste management around Chiang Rai Municipality, with 	

				<p>clearly stated roles, functions, and responsibilities of committees and teams.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Finalize Phitsanulok and Phichit Municipality, is the best practices of solid waste management gained from practical training and work site visits in February 2012. - Local organizations updated their own activity outcomes, external and internal communicate, and interaction between network members via press offices, website (both Chiang Rai Municipality and DELGOSEA website), and vinyl banners.
Results (as stated in the project design)	Indicators (as stated in the project design)	Sources of Information	Possible Risks (external and internal)	
<p>Result II:</p> <p>Local organizations that joined the network have increased capacity to implement the solid waste management especially as the source of waste in community and/or local area.</p>	<p>At least 5 local organizations that are members of the network created projects and initiated operations in solid waste management, particularly in upstream solid waste management</p>	<p>Report the results of operations of each local organization</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Produced publications about achievements 	<p>1) Operational risks include how to continue using the media to promote project goals and activities in solid waste management and source of waste to emphasize understanding between public and related organizations.</p> <p>2) Personnel risks include lack of personnel’s skill, knowledge and expertise in solid waste management and source of waste, and a shortage of manpower in each local organization.</p>	

				3) Risk from external events that are out of the project managers' control. An example is policymakers and senior executives being unable to attend meetings due to urgent work commitments elsewhere. Importance should be placed on policymakers and senior executives in the creation of cooperation in upstream and downstream solid waste management, and in the creation of networks.		
Please list all activities which lead to result II:	Planned in month	Executed in month	Sources of Information	Steps achieved - until last period	Steps achieved – in current period	Problem faced and follow up action
Activity 2.1 Practical training and work site visits to learn about the best practices of solid waste management in Thailand (Bhichit Municipality and Phitsanulok Municipality)	22-23 February 2012	22-23 February 2012	-Document of practical training, work site visits, and activity reports - Assessment of pre test and post test of knowledge -Summary report of the results of practical training and work site visits with activity photos - Summary report of assessment knowledge -Summary report of assessment activity	- To coordinate Phitsanulok and Phichit Municipality about the training and work site visits programme. - To submit the invitation letters and the attached training programme to the network of integrated solid waste management local organizations. - To visit and learn about the best practices of solid waste management in Phitsanulok and Phichit Municipality.	- The training and work sit visits was done on 22-23 February 2012. - Chiang Rai Municipality submitted summary report from the training to the network of integrated solid waste management local organizations.	
Please list all activities which lead to result II:	Planned in month	Executed in month	Sources of Information	Steps achieved - until last period	Steps achieved – in current period	Problem faced and follow up action
Activity 2.2 Produced publications about achievements made in upstream solid waste management in Chiang Rai Municipality by the integrated	25 May 2012	25 May 2012	-100 document about achievements made in upstream solid waste management in	- To arrange the meeting for the produced publications. - To brainstorm and select the	- 100 copies showing information of the Cooperation with Local Administrative Organizations for	

solid waste management network			Chiang Rai Municipality by the integrated solid waste management network	achievements made in upstream solid waste management in Chiang Rai by the network of integrated solid waste management local organizations. - To draft the contents of publications.	Integrated Solid Waste Management in Chiang Rai City project with 10 local organizations started work and advanced implement for integrated solid waste management in their own organization.	
Results (as stated in the project design)	Indicators (as stated in the project design)		Sources of Information	Possible Risks (external and internal)		
Result III: Set-up projects and activities for solid waste management to serve as good examples that can be shared with other communities or local organizations	The good examples of projects and activities for solid waste management. There are at least 5 examples of projects and activities that can be shared with other communities or local organizations		-Report the result of operations by each local organization -Press image -Activity photos -Documented responses to participate in activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Municipal administrators and Tambon Administrative Organizations administrators around the Chiang Rai Municipality were unable to participate in training seminars or site visits due to other urgent commitments elsewhere, and had to send representatives instead. 		
Please list all activities which lead to result III:	Planned in month	Executed in month	Sources of Information	Steps achieved - until last period	Steps achieved -in current period	Problem faced and follow up action
Activity 3.1 Learning and sharing events, projects, / activities related to upstream solid waste management will be organized on the World Environment Day on June 5, 2012	5 June 2012	2 June 2012	-At least 5 local organizations that can implement good projects and activities for solid waste management will have their results shared during learning	- Chiang Rai Municipality set up the working group and network members meeting for preparation the event. - Local organizations, academic institutions, schools, local	- Chiang Rai Municipality organized the World Environment Day on 2 June 2012 at Suan Tung (as a walking street). - 6 local organizations network joined activities. - Post activity of the	

			events	governments, and other organizations were invited to involve activity by Chiang Rai Municipality. - Chiang Rai Municipality and other local organizations contribute this event to the visibility by involving their press office, broadcast, website, and vinyl banners.	event on Chiang Rai Municipality website. - Chiang Rai Municipality arranged the internal meeting for summary report and lesson learned after event on 13 June 2012.	
Step 1 Select and invite local governments in the network to present their community solid waste management result on World Environment Day 2012	May. 2012	8 May 2012		- To submit invitation letters to local governments and promote the event to the public via office press, broadcast, vinyl banners, and website.	- 6 local organizations network joined activities.	
Step 2 Meeting of working group and network members for preparation	May. 2012	21 May 2012		- To set up the meeting for preparation the event and also review about what have been done and problems.		
Step 3 World Environment Day 2012	Jun 2012	2 June 2012		- Chiang Rai Municipality organized the World Environment Day on 2 June 2012 at Suan Tung (as a walking street).	- Post activity of the event on Chiang Rai Municipality website. - Chiang Rai Municipality arranged the internal meeting for summary report and lesson learned after event on 13 June 2012.	

Results (as stated in the project design)	Indicators (as stated in the project design)	Sources of Information			
<p>Result III: Replication project evidenced to fulfil its specific Objectives and contributes to reaching the Overall Objective of the DELGOSEA project management</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amount of activities and evidence of effects of the different LGAs in support of the transfer processes in the municipalities; • Factual evidence of involvement of local authorities on political framework improvement for democratic local governance in the province/country; • Number and quality of requests or suggestions for legal or political changes in the framework for democratic local governance drafted by the respective LGAs on initiative of the local government; • Factual evidence of promotion of a concrete best practice transfer process by the LGA to other regions/cities in the country. 				
<i>Please list all activities which</i>	Planned in month	Executed in month	Steps achieved - until	Steps achieved –in	Problem faced and

<i>lead to result IV:</i>			last period	current period	follow up action
3.1 Activity Monitoring of transfer process					
Step 1 Monthly/bi-monthly monitoring visits	Total of 4 monitoring visits shall be done from December 2011 onwards	Nov 2011 Dec 2011 Feb 2012 May 2012	4 monitoring visits carried out		
Step 2 Delivering progress reports from transfer process	Jan-aug, 2012	1 week after finishing each monitor	Monthly progress reports to the national coordination office		
Step 3 Documenting achievements of BP introduction	July,2012	June,2012		done	
3.2 Activity Dissemination of results					
Step 1 LGA supports improvements in legal and political regulations, which facilitate improvement of living conditions of disadvantaged groups through increased participation of people in local planning and decision-making	March-aug, 2012	June 2012	Final Policy Recommendations have been developed; advocacy activities ongoing		
Step 2 Pilot city itself is made a BP for national distribution	March-aug, 2012	August 2012	First dissemination done		
Step 3 LGA supports distribution of newly created BP in SOA	Sep-dec, 2012	March 2012	MLT has taken over the work of the DELGOSEA coaches for its new learning center and is sharing the DELGOSEA approach with more cities in Thailand		